

MINUTES
ALACHUA COUNTY
VALUE ADJUSTMENT BOARD
MEETING

Thursday, October 3, 2013 – 2:00 p.m.
County Administration Building
Grace Knight Conference Room - 2nd Floor
12 Southeast First Street
Gainesville, Florida

PRESENT: Commissioner Susan Baird, Chair, Commissioner Robert “Hutch” Hutchinson, Vice Chair, School Board member Dr. Leanetta McNealy, Citizen member appointed by the School Board, Kirk Smith, Citizen member appointed by the Board of County Commissioners, Ruben Ramos.

ALSO PRESENT: Clerk of the Circuit Court J.K. Irby, Property Appraiser Ed Crapo, VAB Attorney Denise Lyn, Property Appraiser Attorney Val Bates, VAB Deputy Clerk Deanne Williams and VAB Deputy Clerk Rosie Gilmore.

1. Call to Order -

Chair Baird called the meeting to order at 2:01 p.m.

2. Approval of the Amended Agenda

Commissioner Hutchinson moved to approve the amended agenda. The motion carried 5-0.

3. Approve minutes of the VAB meeting on July 8, 2013

Citizen member Smith moved to approve the July 8, 2013 minutes. The motion carried 5-0.

4. 2012-086-V & 2012-88-V Findings of Fact

VAB Attorney Lyn presented the above item.

Attorney Andrew Cohn was present by phone for the Petitioner.

Commissioner Hutchinson moved to request the Magistrate to explain why he allowed a 10% reduction to the income approach, thereby including the sales comparison methodology with an income approach to value and to reconsider his decision.

Citizen member Smith moved a substitute motion to reject the findings of the Special Magistrate based on the value of rental being a major component of the income approach evaluation and over a 27% discrepancy in the value of the lease and have the Magistrate review again. The motion failed 2-3 with Baird, Ramos and McNealy opposing.

Citizen member Ramos moved to approve the Magistrate's recommendation to grant Petitions 2012-86-V and 2012-088-V. The motion carried 4-1 with Smith opposing.

Exemptions

<u>Petition #</u>	<u>Magistrate Recommends to Deny</u>
2013-027-HD	Phyllis Miller

Commissioner Hutchinson moved to approve the Magistrate's recommendation to deny Petition 2013-027-HD.

Chair Baird recognized Phyllis Miller to address the VAB.

Citizen Smith moved a substitute motion to deny the Magistrate's recommendation and grant Petition 2013-027-HD. The motion carried 4-1 with Ramos opposing.

<u>Petition #</u>	<u>Magistrate Recommends to Deny</u>
2013-032-HD	Bernice Campbell

Citizen member Smith moved to approve the Magistrate's recommendation to deny Petition 2013-032-HD. The motion carried 4-1 with McNealy opposing.

Chair Baird recognized Bernice Campbell, Kevin Porterfield, Susie Swiers and Attorney Val Bates to address the VAB.

<u>Petition #</u>	<u>Magistrate Recommends to Grant</u>
2013-035-OD	Gainesville Hillel Inc.

Citizen member Smith moved to approve the Magistrate's recommendation to grant Petition 2013-035-OD.

Chair Baird recognized Ed Crapo, Attorney Byron Flagg, Rabi Gail Sperglow, and Dan Marvel.

Citizen member Smith moved a substitute motion to reject the Magistrate's recommendation for Petition 2013-035-OD, that the denial letter was insufficient and for the

Magistrate consider the testimony and evidence provided at the hearing to be entitled to the exemption or not. The motion carried 4-1 with Commissioner Hutchinson opposing.

Petition #

[Magistrate Recommends to Grant](#)

2013-025-OD

CEBUDV Auth Dist of FL Inc

Chair Baird recognized Juan Calama to address the VAB.

Commissioner Hutchinson moved to approve the Magistrate's recommendation to grant 2013-025-OD. The motion carried 5-0.

Petition #

[Magistrate Recommends to Grant](#)

2013-028-AD

Phil & Ruth Denton

Commissioner Hutchinson moved to approve the Magistrate's recommendation to grant Petition 2013-028-AD. The motion carried 5-0.

Exemptions

Petition #

[Magistrate Recommends to Deny](#)

2013-001-H
2013-013-H
2013-015-H
2013-034-OD
2013-050-HD

Hugo Gonzalez
Kimberly McCray
John D Rimes Jr.
Ayurveda Health Retreat
Greg Giordano

Commissioner Hutchinson moved to approve the Magistrate's recommendation to deny Petition 2013-001-H, 2013-013-H, 2013-015-H, 2013-034-OD and 2013-050-HD. The motion carried 5-0.

Real Property

Petition #

[Magistrate Recommends to Deny](#)

2012-331-V

Mary Day-Petrano

Chair Baird recognized Dave Petrano and Val Bates to address the VAB.

Commissioner Hutchinson moved to approve the Magistrate's recommendation to deny Petition 2012-331-V. The motion carried 5-0.

5. Authorize the Chair to sign the Decision of the VAB (Form DR-485-V) for each of the final decisions made by the VAB and the 2012 Certification of the VAB (Form DR-488).

Commissioner Hutchinson moved to authorize the chair to sign the DR-485-V form for each of the final decisions made by the VAB and the 2012 DR-488 forms. The motion carried 5-0.

6. Public Comment

There was no one present who wished to address the VAB.

7. Adjourned at 4:38 p.m.

DRAFT